

Nazif Muhtaroglu
CV

e-mail: nazifm81@gmail.com

Telefon: (0090) 5385429554

Web-adresi: <https://bahcesehir.academia.edu/NazifMuhtaroglu>

İş Bilgisi: Bahçeşehir Üniversitesi, Genel Eğitim Birimi, Yarı Zamanlı Öğretim Görevlisi
Mimar Sinan Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü, Yarı Zamanlı Öğretim Görevlisi

Uzmanlık Alanları: İslam Felsefesi ve Entelektüel Tarihi, Modern Felsefe, Din Felsefesi

Yeterlilik Alanları: Orta Çağ Felsefesi, Bilim Felsefesi, Dil Felsefesi, Disiplinlerarası Eleştirel Düşünme, Kültürlerarası Felsefe, Halk Felsefesi

Eğitim ve Kariyer

Doçentlik, Üniversiteler Arası Kurul (Ağustos 2021)

Post-doktora: Harvard Üniversitesi, Yakın-Doğu Dilleri ve Medeniyetleri Bölümü

Doktora Yeterlilik: Kentucky Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü

Doktora Tezi: “Islamic and Cartesian Roots of Occasionalism” (Vesileciliğin İslami ve Kartezyen Kökenleri)

D. Tez Komitesi: Brandon Look, John Walbridge, David Bradshaw, David Hunter, Daniel Breazeale, Jeremy Popkin

Yüksek Lisans: Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü

Yüksek Lisans Tezi: “The Knowledge of Contingent A Priori Truths, Performatives and Pragmatic Inferences” (Olumsal A priori Doğruların Bilgisi, Eylemseller ve Pragmatik Çıkarımlar)

Y. L. Tez Komitesi: İlhan İnan, Stephen Voss, Ali Karatay

Lisans: Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü

Ödüller ve Araştırma Destekleri

- 1) Boğaziçi Üniversitesi-Tübitak Bidep 2232 Araştırma Bursu (2014-2016)
 - 2) Kalam Research & Media Center ve John Templeton Foundation Konferans Düzenleme/Kitap Yazma Desteği (toplam \$35,000, 2014-2015)
 - 3) Harvard Üniversitesi Felsefe Bölümü ve Bilim, Din, Kültür Programı Konferans Düzenleme Desteği (2013)
 - 4) Kentucky Üniversitesi Konferans Katılım desteği (5 defa, 2007-2011)
 - 5) Kentucky Üniversitesi, Commonwealth Research Award (2007)
-

Mesleki ve Akademik Faaliyetler/Yönetilen Yüksek Lisans ve Doktora Tezleri Yüksek Lisans Tezleri

Zahra Karandish. *A Critical Assessment of Hume's and al-Ghazālī's Views on Critique of Causation*. Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, 2018.

Ahmet Halil Oğuzhan Gül. *Leibniz's Criticism of Occasionalism and a Response through a Reconstruction of al-Ghazālī's and Malebranche's Arguments*. Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, 2019.

Yayınlar

Uluslararası hakemli dergilerde yayımlanan makaleler (Art and Humanities Citation Index/AHCI):

- 1) "Al-Bāqillāni's Cosmological Argument from Agency" *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy*, 26, no: 2 (2016): 271-289.

Uluslararası kitap derlemeleri:

- 1) Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka & Nazif Muhtaroglu (ed.). *Classic Issues in Islamic Philosophy and Theology Today*. Dordrecht: Springer, 2010.
- 2) Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka, Detlev Quintern, Nazif Muhtaroglu (ed.). *The Logos of Life and Cultural Interlacing*. Dordrecht: Springer, 2014.
- 3) Nazif Muhtaroglu (ed.). *Occasionalism Revisited: New Essays from the Islamic and Western Philosophical Traditions*. Abu Dhabi: Kalam Research and Media, 2017.

Ulusal Kitap:

- 1) Nazif Muhtaroglu. *Aklın Üç Yüzü: Eleştirel, Çok-Yönlü, Yenilikçi Düşünce*. Bilge-Kültür Sanat Yayınevi, 2022.

Ulusal Kitap edisyon:

- 1) Ali Sedad. *Kavâidü't-Taḥavvülât fî Ḥarekâti'z-Zerrât*. (Nazif Muhtaroglu & Bilal Ayan). Konya: Çizgi Yayınevi, 2020.

Uluslararası kitaplarda yayımlanan makaleler:

- 1) "A Linguistic Analysis of the Omnipotence Puzzle" *Logic, Language and Metaphysics: Selected Papers from the 1st SIFA Graduate Conference* içinde, ed. Vittorio Morato and Massimiliano Carrara. (London: College Publication, 2009), 197-211.
- 2) "An Occasionalist Defense of Free Will" *Classic Issues in Islamic Philosophy and Theology Today* içinde, ed. Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka and Nazif Muhtaroglu, (Dordrecht: Springer, 2010), 45-62.
- 3) "The Christian and Islamic Roots of a Holistic Rhetoric" *Islamic Philosophy and Occidental Phenomenology in Dialogue vol. 6: Sharing Poetic Expressions* içinde, ed. Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka, (Dordrecht: Springer, 2011), 139-148.
- 4) "Ali Sedad Bey's (d.1900) *Kavâidü't-Taḥavvülât fî Ḥarekâti'z-Zerrât (Principles of Transformation in the Motion of Particles)*" *Oxford Handbook of Islamic Philosophy*

içinde, ed. Khaled El-Rouayheb & Sabine Schmidke, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), 586-606.

- 5) “Al-Māturīdī’s View of Causality” in *Occasionalism Revisited: New Essays from the Islamic and Western Traditions* içinde, ed. Nazif Muhtaroglu. (Abu Dhabi: Kalam Research and Media, 2017), 3-21.
- 6) “Ash‘arites, Cartesians and Occasionalism” *Occasionalism Revisited: New Essays from the Islamic and Western Traditions* içinde, ed. Nazif Muhtaroglu. (Abu Dhabi: Kalam Research and Media, 2017), 105-138.
- 7) “Late Ottoman Occasionalists on Modern Science” *Occasionalism Revisited: New Essays from the Islamic and Western Traditions* içinde, ed. Nazif Muhtaroglu. (Abu Dhabi: Kalam Research and Media, 2017), 83-102. O. Koca ile birlikte

Ulusal hakemli dergilerde yayınlanan makaleler:

- 1) “An Occasionalist Approach to Miracles” *İslam Araştırmaları Dergisi*, sayı: 22, (2009): 71-93.
- 2) “What is Wrong with Concurrentism?” *Kaygı*, 23 (2014): 129-144.
- 3) “Tanrı’nın Tekliğine Dair Modal Argüman” (A Modal Argument for the Uniqueness of God), *Felsefe Arkivi*, no: 51 (2019): 179-186.
- 4) “Tanrı’nın Tekliği’ne Dair Tartışmalar” (Discussions on the Uniqueness of God), *Tasavvur: Tekirdağ İlahiyat Dergisi*, Aralık no:6/2 (2020): 1153-1164.
- 5) “Plantinga and Ash‘arites on Divine Simplicity” (Tanrı’nın Basitliği Hakkında Plantinga ve Eşariler’in Görüşleri), *Kader*, no.18/2 (2020): 488-499.

Ulusal kitaplarda yayınlanan makaleler:

- 1) “Nicolas Malebranche” *Düşüncenin Serüveni* içinde, ed. Bayram Ali Çetinkaya, (İstanbul: İnsan Yayınları, 2016), Cilt: 3, 115-124.
- 2) “Ebu’l-Hasan El-Eş‘arî” *Düşüncenin Serüveni* içinde, ed. Bayram Ali Çetinkaya, (İstanbul: İnsan Yayınları, 2016), Cilt: 5, 169-182.

Kitap Kritikleri:

- 1) Hamidreza Ayatollahi, *The Existence of God: Mulla Sadra’s Seddiqin Argument versus Criticisms of Kant and Hume*, in *Philosophy East and West*, vol: 58, no: 2 (2008): 283-285.
 - 2) Ibrahim M. Abu-Rabi, ed. *Theodicy and Justice in Modern Islamic Thought: The Case of Said Nursi*, in *Philosophy East and West*, vol: 62, no: 3 (2012): 608-610.
 - 3) Khaled El-Rouayheb, *Islamic Intellectual History in the Seventeenth Century: Scholarly Currents in the Ottoman Empire and Maghreb*, in *Nazariyat*, vol: 2, no: 4 (2016): 193-197.
 - 4) Mehmet Bulğen, *Klasik İslam Düşüncesinde Atomculuk Eleştirileri (Criticisms of Atomism in Classical Islamic Thought)*, in *Cumhuriyet Theology Journal*, vol: 22, no:1 (2018): 743-746.
-

Bildiriler ve Konferanslar

Düzenlenen Uluslararası Konferanslar:

- 1) *Kentucky Üniversitesi*: “International Graduate Student Conference: Islamic Philosophy and Theology Today,” 28-30 Eylül 2007. Oliver Leaman ile birlikte
- 2) *Harvard Üniversitesi*: “Poetic Expressions: Saying the Same in Different Ways,” 13-14 Ağustos 2009. Anna-Teresa Tymieniecka ile birlikte
- 3) *Harvard Üniversitesi*: “Occasionalism East and West,” 4-5 Mayıs 2013.
- 4) *Boğaziçi Üniversitesi*: “Occasionalism and Theories of Causality,” İstanbul, 2-7 Haziran 2015. Chryssi Sidiropoulou ile birlikte

Uluslararası Kongre/Sempozyum/Çalıştaylarda Sunulan Bildiriler:

- 1) “Muslim and Christian Views on Miracles in the Medieval Period” *Western Michigan Üniversitesi*: 42nd International Congress on Medieval Studies, Kalamazoo-A.B.D., Mayıs 2007.
- 2) “Omnipotence Puzzle: A third Option” *Padua Üniversitesi*: 1st International Graduate Student Conference: Knowledge, Language and Metaphysics, Padua-İtalya, Eylül 2007.
- 3) “Şadr al-Sharī‘a on Free Will” *Fordham Üniversitesi*: 4th International Conference on Ancient and Medieval Philosophy, New York-A.B.D., Ekim 2007.
- 4) “The Development of the Notion of Free Will in the Medieval Sunni Islamic Thought” *Loyola Üniversitesi*: 2007 Annual Meeting of the Louisiana Consortium for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, New Orleans-A.B.D., Ekim 2007.
- 5) “Aquinas’s and al-Ghazālī’s Intuitions regarding Omnipotence” *Marquette Üniversitesi*: Summer Conference, Philosophy in the Abrahamic Traditions, Milwaukee-A.B.D., Haziran 2008.
- 6) “Al-Māturīdī’s View of Causality” *Harvard Üniversitesi*: Occasionalist East and West Conference, Boston-A.B.D., Mayıs 2013.
- 7) “Ali Sedad Bey’s Kavâidü’-t-Tahavvülât fî Harekâti’z-Zerrât” *Niagara Üniversitesi*, Turkish Studies Workshop, Upstate New York A.B.D., Mart 2014.
- 8) “Ali Sedad: An Ash‘arite View on Modern Science” *Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi*, 8th International Conference of Asian Philosophical Association, Isparta, Nisan 2015.
- 9) “Hume, Kant and Al-Ghazālī on the Universal Principle of Causality” *Boğaziçi Üniversitesi*, Occasionalism and Causality Conference, İstanbul, Haziran 2015.
- 10) “The Islamic Background of Descartes’s Laws of Nature” *Oxford Üniversitesi*, Workshop: Early Modern Laws of Nature: Secular and Divine, Oxford-İngiltere, Temmuz 2016.
- 11) “The Māturīdite View on Human Will and Contemporary Cognitive Psychology” *Kalam Research and Media*, Maturidi Conference, Amman-Ürdün, Ekim 2017.
- 12) “An Analysis of Strong Artificial Intelligence in terms of Two Ontologies” *Artificial Intelligence Conference*, Cambridge Muslim College, Cambridge-İngiltere, Eylül 2018.
- 13) “Homo Deus: İnsan Tanrı olabilir mi?” *ICAR Uluslararası Akademik Araştırmalar Kongresi*, Bolu, 17-19 Şubat 2020.
- 14) “Kötülük Problemi ve Mümkün Dünyalar: Gazzali ve Leibniz üzerinden Bir Çözümleme” *USVES (Uluslararası Sosyal ve Eğitim Bilimleri Sempozyumu)*, İstanbul, 22-23 Şubat 2020.

- 15) “A Modal Argument for the Uniqueness of God” *The American Society of Islamic Philosophy and Theology-Harvard University*, 2nd Annual Islamic Philosophy Conference, Online, Aralık 2020.
- 16) “The Meaning of ‘God’: A Kalamic Approach” *The American Society of Islamic Philosophy and Theology-Harvard University*, 3rd Annual Islamic Philosophy Conference, Online, Aralık 2021.
- 17) “Revisiting Kalam Foundationalism in Response to Contemporary Challenges” Cambridge Muslim College, *Imagining Islamic Epistemology for the 21st Century* Conference, Cambridge-İngiltere, Temmuz 2022.

Ulusal Kongre/Sempozyum/Çalıştaylarda Sunulan Bildiriler:

- 1) “Al-Bāqillāni’s Cosmological Argument from Agency” *Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, Arda Denkeli Festivali*, İstanbul, Aralık 2015.
- 2) “Olmayana Erginin Hayatımızdaki Yeri”, Bülent Ecevit Üniversitesi, 8. *Mantık Çalıştayı*, Zonguldak, Mayıs 2018.
- 3) “Bağlamsallık Açısından İnformel Mantık-Formel Mantık İlişkisi”, Kastamonu Üniversitesi, 11. *Mantık Çalıştayı*, Kastamonu Mayıs 2022.

Diğer:

- 1) “Özel Adların Anlamı Hakkında Bazı Notlar”, *Öncül Analitik Felsefe Dergisi (Öncül Analytic Philosophy Journal)*, February 2021. Link: <https://onculanalitikfelsefe.com/ozel-adlarin-anlami-hakkinda-bazi-notlar-nazif-muhtaroglu/>
- 2) “Taş Paradoksu: Gazzâlî ve Aquinas Üzerinden Bir Çözüm Önerisi”, *Öncül Analitik Felsefe Dergisi (Öncül Analytic Philosophy Journal)*, Nisan 2021. Link: <https://onculanalitikfelsefe.com/tas-paradoksu-gazzali-ve-aquinas-uzerinden-bir-cozum-onerisi-nazif-muhtaroglu/>
- 3) “Kategori Hataları, Paradokslar: Husserl ve Russell”, *Öncül Analitik Felsefe Dergisi (Öncül Analytic Philosophy Journal)*, Temmuz 2021. Link: <https://onculanalitikfelsefe.com/kategori-hatalari-paradokslar-husserl-ve-russell-nazif-muhtaroglu/>

Yayım Aşamasında olan veya Yayım için Hazırlanan Kitap ve Makaleler

Kitaplar

- 1) *Islam and Science: A Sunnī Kalāmīc Framework*, Shoaib Ahmed Malik, David Solomon Jalajel, Hamza Karamali ile birlikte (Routledge, kitap önerisi inceleniyor)
- 2) *Divine Action in Science and Religion: A Comparative Analysis of Ghazālīan Occasionalism and Thomist Concurrentism*, Shoaib Ahmed Malik ile birlikte (yazım aşamasında)

Makaleler

- 1) “Islamic Ethics: A Survey of Major Approaches,” *The Bloomsbury Sourcebook on Islamic Ethics*, içinde kitap bölümü olarak yayımlanacak (ed. Jafar Amir Mahallati).
- 2) “Qādī ‘Abd al-Jabbār” Mehmet Bulgen ile birlikte *Islamic Science: Eight Perspectives* içinde kitap bölümü olarak yayımlanacak (ed. Shoaib A. Malik, Routledge, sözleşmesi yapıldı)
- 3) “God’s Existence and The Uniqueness Claim” (*Islamic Analytic Philosophy* (Saleh Zarepour, ed., Routledge) kitabı için bölüm, değerlendirme aşamasında)
- 4) “An Ash‘arī Perspective on Theology of Nature” Shoaib A. Malik ile birlikte (*European Journal of Analytic Philosophy* için değerlendirme aşamasında)

Verilen Dersler

Bahçeşehir Üniversitesi: Modern Mantık, Klasik Mantık, Mantık I: Eleştirel Düşünce
Islamic Philosophy, Philosophy of Religion, Ethics

Boğaziçi Üniversitesi: The Cartesian Tradition, Main Intellectual Traditions in Islam,
Ghazālian Synthesis

29 Mayıs Üniversitesi: Seminer: İslam ve Batı Felsefesinde Vesilecilik

Mimar Sinan Üniversitesi: Orta Çağ Felsefesi I: Hristiyan Dünyası, Orta Çağ Felsefesi
II:İslam Dünyası, Din Felsefesi

Kentucky Üniversitesi: Introduction to Logic, Introduction to Philosophy, Ancient-Medieval
Philosophy (Alan Perreiah’ın asistanı olarak), Asian Philosophy (Alan Perreiah’ın asistanı
olarak)

Referanslar

Brandon Look (look@uky.edu)
Kentucky Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü

Jeffrey K. McDonough (jkmcdon@fas.harvard.edu)
Harvard Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü

Khaled El-Rouayheb (kel@fas.harvard.edu)
Harvard Üniversitesi, Yakın Doğu Dilleri ve Medeniyetleri Bölümü

İlhan İnan (iinan@ku.edu.tr)
Koç Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü

Chryssi Sidiropoulou (sidiropu@boun.edu.tr)
Boğaziçi Üniversitesi, Felsefe Bölümü

Master's Thesis Abstract: The Knowledge of Contingent A Priori Truths, Performatives and Pragmatic Inferences

Committee: İlhan İnan, Ali Karatay, Stephen Voss

Saul Kripke claims that there are contingent a priori truths. His argument for this claim depends on his account of naming. By assuming his account of naming, I try to improve his argument by adding two premises expressing the satisfaction of the success conditions of the naming activity and using that name. In characterizing the naming activity, I make use of the notion of performatives. In formulating a valid inference from premises to the conclusion, I appeal to the notion of pragmatic inferences. The gist of my argument for the a priority of Kripke's contingent truths is that the knowledge of the mentioned two premises provides the correct grasp of the necessary and sufficient elements in order to grasp the proposition that is considered to be a contingent a priori truth. So this proposition is known just by grasping it without further investigation.

Dissertation Abstract: Islamic and Cartesian Roots of Occasionalism

Committee: Brandon Look (chair), John Walbridge, Daniel Breazeale, David Bradshaw, David Hunter, Jeremy Popkin

Occasionalism is commonly understood as a theory that ascribes all causal power to God on the one hand and treats cause-effect relations in nature as occasions indicating the manner of divine creation. As research on the historical background of David Hume's critique of causality has progressed, western scholars have been increasingly interested in occasionalism. Yet current discussions of occasionalism have given rise to a number of paradoxes that make the doctrine appear to be inconsistent. The paradoxes I have critically examined concern substantiality, causality, modality, omnipotence, determinism, free will, the mind-body problem and miracles. In my opinion, the puzzles pointed out in the literature arise from misinformation and historical inaccuracies about occasionalism. Its Muslim roots are largely unknown and its early modern origins have not been studied sufficiently. As a result, the ordinary reader may be familiar with certain ideas about occasionalism but they are often mixed with inaccurate characterizations of the theory.

In my dissertation, I explore the roots of occasionalism and attempt to clarify it as a metaphysical theory. I show that a close reading of Islamic sources and critical comparison of early modern theories provide some answers to the many questions that have arisen in contemporary research on occasionalism. I bring resolution to these problems by carefully studying the historical roots of occasionalism. I examine its historical development chronologically, and comparatively in order to clarify the similarities and differences between different schools of thought. My dissertation falls mainly into two parts.

The first part of the dissertation focuses on the Islamic roots of occasionalism. This theory was propounded first by the Muslim *mutakallimūn* mainly within an atomistic cosmology. I examine the Mu‘tazila, the Ash‘arite and the Māturīdite schools and particularly al-Ghazālī’s view in relation to occasionalism. I argue that occasionalism lies in the foundation of the *Sunni kalām*. Al-Ghazālī and the *Sunni kalām*, both the Ash‘arite and Māturīdite schools, uniformly embraced occasionalism though the descriptions of their cosmologies differ to a certain extent. The second part deals with the early modern roots of the theory by considering René Descartes’, Louis de La Forge’s, Géraud de Cordemoy’s, and Nicolas Malebranche’s contributions to it. In this part, I argue that Descartes and La Forge settled the general framework in which Cordemoy and Malebranche developed an occasionalist metaphysics. Cordemoy presented his occasionalism in an atomistic cosmology although influenced from Cartesian philosophy, and Malebranche produced the most systematic version of occasionalism that is based on Cartesian metaphysics.

By examining the historical roots of occasionalism, I show that it is a serious metaphysical theory fully capable of dealing with problems in traditional epistemology and metaphysics.
